

OECD ECONOMIC SURVEYS

ESTONIA

ISSN 0376-6438, e-ISSN 1609-7513

December 2019

[Consulta en línea desde Intranet](#)

Executive summary	9
1 Key Policy Insights	15
Introduction	16
A strong economy raises incomes and improves social outcomes	19
Public finances are in good shape	25
The banking sector is well capitalised	35
Nine wellbeing challenges for the coming decade	37
The demographic clock is ticking	38
Flexible life-long learning should be based on people's needs	40
Smart businesses should become new drivers of growth	44
Infrastructure investment is crucial for future productivity growth	47
Inequalities have multiple dimensions	50
Health is a top development need	51
Ensuring safety and security	55
Keeping a clean natural environment	56
Smart public governance in cooperation with people	61
References	64
2 Seizing the productive potential of digital change	69
Productivity needs a boost, and digital technologies can help	70
Better utilising productivity potential of advanced digital technologies	74
Digital foundations are strong	76
Estonian companies lag behind peers in the adoption of digital technologies	83
The ICT sector is dynamic, but has room for improvement	86
Making the most out of skills	90
Basic skills form the foundation for the effective use of digital tools	91
Digital user skills could be improved	95
Specialised ICT skills are concentrated in a small number of companies	99
Management skills and high-performing work practices	101
Automation and changing skill demands pose challenges	104
Boosting digital dissemination in a market-friendly environment	105
Regulations are lean, but with some weaknesses	106
Overcoming lack of scale and increasing awareness of digital potential	108
Easier access to capital would foster productivity growth through digitalisation	110
Innovation and R&D policies to foster digitalisation	110
References	113

Tables

Table 1.1. Macroeconomic indicators and projections	20
Table 1.2. Vulnerabilities that could lead to major changes in the outlook	25
Table 1.3. Fiscal indicators appear healthy	32
Table 1.4. Estimated fiscal impact of selected recommended reforms	34
Table 1.5. Past OECD recommendations to improve fiscal policy	35
Table 1.6. Past OECD recommendations on financial stability	37
Table 1.7. Estimated impact of structural reform on per capita GDP	38
Table 1.8. Past OECD recommendations to improve the education system and upgrade skills	44
Table 1.9. Past OECD recommendations to improve the business environment	47
Table 1.10. Past OECD recommendations to improve infrastructure	50
Table 1.11. Past OECD recommendations to make growth more inclusive	51
Table 1.12. Past OECD recommendations on safety and security	56
Table 1.13. Past OECD recommendations on keeping a clean natural environment	61
Table 1.14. Recommendations to enhance macroeconomic stability, inclusiveness and sustainability	63
Table 2.1. The productivity premiums from digital adoption and skill use are substantial	75

Figures

Figure 1.1. The income and productivity gaps have narrowed	16
Figure 1.2. Income levels and health conditions should improve	18
Figure 1.3. Solid growth boosts living standards	19
Figure 1.4. Employment is high, and unemployment is low	21
Figure 1.5. Reform to re-assess disabled's work ability raised unemployment less than expected	22
Figure 1.6. The economy is operating close to full capacity, but not overheating	23
Figure 1.7. High wage growth challenges competitiveness	24
Figure 1.8. Exports are holding up	25
Figure 1.9. The fiscal balance has slipped into deficit	27
Figure 1.10. General government debt is very low	28
Figure 1.11. Moderate deficits could be sustainable	29
Figure 1.12. The capital stock has quadrupled in two decades, but is lower than the OECD average	33
Figure 1.13. The banking sector appears solid	36
Figure 1.14. The population pyramid will become slimmer, reflecting rapid ageing	39
Figure 1.15. The old-age dependency ratio is sharply increasing	40
Figure 1.16. Basic skills are high	41
Figure 1.17. Almost half of Estonian jobs are at risk of automation or significant change	42
Figure 1.18. Businesses could be more involved in training their employees	43
Figure 1.19. Spending on the unemployed is low	44
Figure 1.20. Few business websites are used for ordering or booking	45
Figure 1.21. The use of robots is particularly low among SMEs	46
Figure 1.22. Smaller firms consider the availability of finance as an obstacle to long-term investment	47
Figure 1.23. Perceived infrastructure quality is close to the OECD average	48
Figure 1.24. Download speed of fixed broadband connections is low	49
Figure 1.25. Inequalities in both market and disposable incomes are in line with the OECD average	50
Figure 1.26. The gender wage gap is high	51
Figure 1.27. Ischaemic heart disease tops the causes of death and colorectal cancer and liver diseases are on the rise	53
Figure 1.28. Perceived health varies widely with income and education levels	54
Figure 1.29. Some countries achieve lower treatable death rates from similar expenditures	55
Figure 1.30. A clean environment, but more needs to be done to curb greenhouse gas emissions	60
Figure 1.31. Perceived corruption is declining	62
Figure 2.1. Productivity growth has declined sharply in many countries, including Estonia	70
Figure 2.2. Weak multifactor productivity growth contrasts relatively strong capital accumulation	71
Figure 2.3. Exporters are heavily relying on foreign inputs	72
Figure 2.4. Productivity dispersion has increased in Estonia, especially in digital intensive industries	72
Figure 2.5. The productivity potential from digital adoption is substantial	73
Figure 2.6. Many firms have own websites, but their functionality is rather limited	76
Figure 2.7. Most firms have a broadband connection, but not ultra-high speed	77

Figure 2.8. The X-Road platform for secure data sharing	78
Figure 2.9. Online availability of government services is high, but could be more mobile friendly	79
Figure 2.10. Government services are transparent and cover a wide range	79
Figure 2.11. Estonians trust key online services	80
Figure 2.12. The security of vital digital services is high	81
Figure 2.13. Digital security lags behind in many companies	82
Figure 2.14. Individuals' digital security awareness and skills need further strengthening	83
Figure 2.15. Estonian enterprises need to adopt more digital tools	84
Figure 2.16. The use of robots is particularly low among SMEs	85
Figure 2.17. A low but increasing share of the population participates in platform work	86
Figure 2.18. Business dynamics in ICT services are strong, 2016	87
Figure 2.19. ICT sector performance is comparable to that in peers	88
Figure 2.20. Trade in digitally deliverable services is low	89
Figure 2.21. The share of ICT-related patents is low	90
Figure 2.22. Basic skills are high	92
Figure 2.23. Restricted work immigration may hold back digital adoption	94
Figure 2.24. Many perceive the impact of immigrants in society as negative	95
Figure 2.25. Adult digital skills are below average in international comparison	96
Figure 2.26. Teachers' preparedness to use ICT for teaching could improve	97
Figure 2.27. Small firms provide less ICT training than larger ones	99
Figure 2.28. Employment of specialised ICT personnel is highly concentrated	99
Figure 2.29. Shortages of ICT specialists are easing	100
Figure 2.30. Managers' skills could be higher and utilised more efficiently	102
Figure 2.31. The use of high-performing work practices is around average	103
Figure 2.32. Vulnerability to automation depends on education, social background, gender and age	104
Figure 2.33. Business dynamics are decent (2016)	106
Figure 2.34. Some room to boost productivity by streamlining regulations remains	106
Figure 2.35. Command and control regulation is more common than in other OECD countries	107
Figure 2.36. Government ownership in network sectors is high	108

Boxes

Box 1.1. Recent government policies towards revitalisation of the economy and greater inclusiveness	17
Box 1.2. The fiscal rule in Estonia	27
Box 1.3. The Estonian pension system	31
Box 1.4. PPPs for better infrastructure outcomes	33
Box 1.5. Quantifying the fiscal impact of selected reforms	34
Box 1.6. Quantifying selected structural reforms	38
Box 1.7. Policy responses to regional industrial transition	58
Box 2.1. Firm- and sector-level productivity gains from digital technology adoption in Estonia	75
Box 2.2. E-Estonia	78
Box 2.3. Estonia – a Digital Security forerunner	81
Box 2.4. Examples of programmes to develop companies' training of personnel	98

OECD ECONOMIC SURVEYS

INDIA

ISSN 0376-6438, e-ISSN 1609-7513

December 2019

[Consulta en línea desde Intranet](#)

Executive summary	9
Key policy insights	15
Economic growth has been strong, but social and governance challenges remain	15
India remains a growth champion despite recent slowdown	20
Improving governance	27
Addressing key social challenges and providing access to core public services for all	38
Promoting investment and productivity to boost income convergence	45
Air pollution is a major challenge for green growth and wellbeing	58
References	63
Thematic chapters	69
Chapter 1. Challenges and opportunities of India's enhanced participation in the global economy	71
India has seized many opportunities	72
The large diaspora living abroad is an asset	77
India could perform better in some domains	79
More foreign investment could promote income growth and support export performance	101
Mitigating the adverse effects of enhanced participation in the global economy	104
References	106
Chapter 2. Housing for all	111
A persistent shortage with many vacant units points to large imbalances in the housing market ...	113
Making the housing market more efficient	125
Improving affordability of housing with government support	131
References	141

Tables

Table 1. India's growth is projected to recover gradually	26
Table 2. Events that could lead to changes in the outlook	27
Table 3. GST/VAT: reduced rates and registration thresholds across selected countries	34
Table 4. Past OECD recommendations on public finance	35
Table 5. Illustrative fiscal impact of selected reforms	35
Table 6. Government non-tax financial incentives to promote saving for retirement	44
Table 7. Past OECD recommendations on promoting more inclusive growth	44
Table 8. Impact of reforms to boost potential GDP	47
Table 9. Insolvency and Bankruptcy Code: encouraging outcomes but delays should be reduced further	54
Table 10. Past OECD recommendations on promoting investment and productivity	58
Table 11. Findings and recommendations	62
Table 1.1. Unilateral <i>versus</i> multilateral cut in tariffs: impacts for the Indian economy	100

Table 1.2. Macroeconomic impact of a reduction in India's barriers to trade.....	101
Table 1.3. Recommendations to improve India's participation in the world economy.....	106
Table 2.1. Progress in the amendment of rent control has been slow	124
Table 2.2. Easing the business environment would help the housing sector.....	128
Table 2.3. The Floor Space Index is very low in India	130
Table 2.4. The Credit Linked Subsidy Scheme	133
Table 2.5. Main recommendations for providing better housing for all.....	140

Figures

Figure 1. GDP has grown steadily but income per capita remains low.....	16
Figure 2. Challenges remain to improving wellbeing	17
Figure 3. Inequality is high.....	19
Figure 4. Income per capita varies considerably across states	20
Figure 5. Growth has slowed from a hefty pace.....	21
Figure 6. Headline inflation remains below the 4% target.....	22
Figure 7. India has specialised in fast growing markets.....	23
Figure 8. There is some room for further cuts in repo rates	23
Figure 9. Recent cuts in repo rates have not been fully reflected in deposit rates for small savings schemes	24
Figure 10. Public sector borrowing needs are large	25
Figure 11. Public debt and yields on government bonds.....	28
Figure 12. General government debt to GDP ratio under four stylised scenarios	30
Figure 13. Public spending remains low but interest payments account for a large share	31
Figure 14. The tax-to-GDP ratio remains low	33
Figure 15. Standard GST/VAT rates across selected countries.....	34
Figure 16. Indicators of corruption.....	37
Figure 17. The employment rate has declined and is low for women.....	39
Figure 18. Health care resources are low	42
Figure 19. The investment rate is recovering gradually	45
Figure 20. Potential growth is slowing down	46
Figure 21. Bank loans are decelerating, after two years of strong growth	48
Figure 22. The share of public banks in loans is decreasing	48
Figure 23. Non-performing loans have started to decline but remain high in public banks.....	50
Figure 24. Banks' quality of assets and profitability remain low.....	51
Figure 25. The ease of doing business has improved	52
Figure 26. The contribution of the ICT sector in the economy is large.....	56
Figure 27. Internet penetration has increased mainly in urban areas	57
Figure 28. Digital payments are growing fast	58
Figure 29. Green growth indicators.....	60
Figure 1.1. India has become a major actor in the global economy	73
Figure 1.2. Trade intensity has increased	74
Figure 1.3. Export performance has been solid.....	75
Figure 1.4. Growth in services exports has been rapid.....	75
Figure 1.5. The composition of exports has moved towards skill- and capital-intensive items.....	76
Figure 1.6. Export products and markets are diversified.....	77
Figure 1.7. Migration flows, stocks and remittances are large.....	78
Figure 1.8. Changes in US imports from selected countries	80
Figure 1.9. Exports of textile, garment and footwear: losing steam and market share.....	81

Figure 1.10. The skill and technology content of manufacturing exports has increased.....	81
Figure 1.11. Wages are lower than in many other competitors	82
Figure 1.12. Electricity prices are high for businesses	83
Figure 1.13. Infrastructure and trade logistics are weighing on India's competitiveness	84
Figure 1.14. India has improved and compares well on most trade facilitation dimensions.....	87
Figure 1.15. Import tariffs have been cut but remain high and dispersed	89
Figure 1.16. Halving import tariffs would benefit most low-income households.....	90
Figure 1.17. A moderate use of non-tariff measures, except local content and anti-dumping	92
Figure 1.18. Services trade restrictions, as measured by the OECD, are relatively stringent	95
Figure 1.19. Economic impact of a multilateral and unilateral cut in service trade restrictions	97
Figure 1.20. India has developed preferential trade agreements but their depth is limited	99
Figure 1.21. Inward foreign direct investment has remained relatively low despite lighter regulations	103
Figure 2.1. Affordability has improved but remains an issue	113
Figure 2.2. The urban housing shortage has worsened.....	114
Figure 2.3. The share of people living in slums is comparable to other EMEs but high in some states	115
Figure 2.4. Housing conditions are better in rich states	116
Figure 2.5. Fewer homeless people in rural areas but more in urban areas.....	117
Figure 2.6. Access to basic services has improved.....	118
Figure 2.7. Housing prices have decelerated.....	119
Figure 2.8. Low and middle income groups cannot afford a house	120
Figure 2.9. Affordability in the rental market is less an issue	120
Figure 2.10. Housing vacancy rates in urban areas are large	121
Figure 2.11. The share of tenants is small	122
Figure 2.12. Rental yields are low	123
Figure 2.13. The share of urban population will increase rapidly	125
Figure 2.14. Registering a property is long and costly	129
Figure 2.15. India is a dense country.....	130
Figure 2.16. Transactions costs are high compared to other EMEs	131
Figure 2.17. Progress on the <i>Housing for all</i> programme	135
Figure 2.18. Housing credit growth has increased more than total credit	138
Figure 2.19. Household indebtedness is low compared with other countries	139
Figure 2.20. Credit regulation and information could be improved	139

Boxes

Box 1. Debt sustainability analysis	29
Box 2. Reforming price subsidies: the Direct Benefit Transfer model	32
Box 3. The agricultural sector in India: key features and policies	40
Box 4. The impact of structural reforms on per capita income	46
Box 5. Measures taken to address non-performing loans.....	49
Box 6. Measures taken to strengthen supervision and regulation of non-banking financial companies.....	52
Box 7. The Insolvency and Bankruptcy Code: key features, outcomes and international comparisons.....	55
Box 1.1. Key factors behind the success of the ICT sector	76
Box 1.2. Ongoing programmes to improve ports and roads: Sagarmala and Bharatmala.....	85
Box 1.3. NITI Aayog has proposed creating Coastal Employment Zones.....	86

Box 1.4. The OECD Service Trade Restrictiveness Index: key features	94
Box 1.5. OECD simulations: impacts of a unilateral <i>versus</i> multilateral cut in services trade restrictions	96
Box 1.6. OECD simulations: impact of a unilateral reduction in trade barriers.....	100
Box 1.7. Recent changes in e-commerce rules.....	104
Box 2.1. The Real Estate (Regulation and Development) Act: a game changer	126
Box 2.2 Past housing programmes in India	131
Box 2.3. Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana - Housing for all	133
Box 2.4. Social housing in selected economies.....	137

OECD ECONOMIC SURVEYS

NORWAY

ISSN 0376-6438, e-ISSN 1609-7513

December 2019

[Consulta en línea desde Intranet](#)

Executive Summary	9
1 Key policy insights	14
Macroeconomic prospects, risks and policy responses	18
Fiscal policy, tax and public spending reform	30
Towards higher productivity in the business sector	39
Employment levels need strengthening	44
Improving education and skills	49
Norway should build on its relatively good policies for environmental sustainability	51
Bibliography	56
2 Maintaining high employment	57
Introduction	57
Key aspects of Norway's labour market	58
Key policy areas for strengthening employment outcomes	74
Bibliography	113

FIGURES

Figure 1. GDP growth is robust	10
Figure 2. House prices remain elevated	11
Figure 3. Non-oil deficits can no longer increase rapidly	11
Figure 4. Labour force participation has been falling	12
Figure 1.1. Norway scores highly on many dimensions of wellbeing	14
Figure 1.2. GDP per capita is among the highest in the OECD	15
Figure 1.3. Norway is facing a number of important challenges	17
Figure 1.4. Recent macroeconomic developments: economic growth remains robust	20
Figure 1.5. Reflecting the upturn, monetary and fiscal support are being reduced	21
Figure 1.6. Some housing-market cooling but household debt burdens remain elevated	25
Figure 1.7. Commercial real estate prices have reached new highs	26
Figure 1.8. Further increase in the counter-cyclical buffer in bank capital requirements	27
Figure 1.9. Debt-to-income and loan-to-value limits are having impact	28
Figure 1.10. Bank wholesale funding has increased substantially alongside bank balance sheets	29
Figure 1.11. Government spending remains substantial and similar to other Nordic countries	31
Figure 1.12. Slowing growth in the value of the wealth fund and structural non-oil deficits	32
Figure 1.13. Deficit constraints and budgeting headwinds are sizeable	33
Figure 1.14. Steady rise in public pension and health-care costs lie ahead	34
Figure 1.15. Fiscal sustainability: illustrative scenarios	34
Figure 1.16. Norway's statutory corporate tax rate now compares more favourably	35
Figure 1.17. Norwegian business faces high labour costs	39
Figure 1.18. Around 70% of goods exports are bound for other European countries	39
Figure 1.19. Generally good settings in product-market regulation but with some room for improvement	41

Figure 1.20. Expenditure on R&D has risen	42
Figure 1.21. Corruption is well controlled and viewed as very low compared with other countries	43
Figure 1.22. Disability benefit rates are falling in pre-retirement cohorts, but rising for younger people	45
Figure 1.23. Numbers heading for retirement continue to increase	47
Figure 1.24. The unemployment rate of low-education immigrants is high	48
Figure 1.25. Green growth indicators for Norway	52
Figure 1.26. Effective carbon rates (ECR)	53
Figure 1.27. Revenue from car related taxation is declining	54
Figure 2.1. The labour market has tightened	58
Figure 2.2. The labour market performs well in international comparison	59
Figure 2.3. The labour market is resilient and reasonably adaptable	60
Figure 2.4. The employment rate is high, but has fallen over the past decade	61
Figure 2.5. The drop in employment rates is concentrated among the prime-age group	62
Figure 2.6. Wages are compressed and income inequality is low	64
Figure 2.7. Poverty is low	65
Figure 2.8. Employment gaps are sizable for some disadvantaged groups, notably people with disabilities and non-natives	66
Figure 2.9. Gender labour income gap is sizeable due to shorter working hours of women	67
Figure 2.10. Cyclical labour migration is a shock absorber	68
Figure 2.11. Terms of trade gains have cushioned Norway from the productivity slowdown	69
Figure 2.12. Reallocation from low to high-wage firms is faster in Norway than in the United States	70
Figure 2.13. Norway has also experienced job polarisation	71
Figure 2.14. A significant share of jobs is at risk of being automated or significantly changed by technology in the future	72
Figure 2.15. Share of non-routine employment and ICT task intensity are high in Norway	73
Figure 2.16. Employment rates have declined more rapidly for people with low education	73
Figure 2.17. Health limitations and low education are the most common employment barriers in Norway	74
Figure 2.18. Groups facing different combinations of employment barriers	75
Figure 2.19. Norway has the largest share of disability recipients and the highest number of days of sickness absences	76
Figure 2.20. Disability Benefit claimant levels are falling in pre-retirement cohorts, but are rising in younger cohorts	77
Figure 2.21. Sickness absence in Norway	77
Figure 2.22. Norway's mandated sick leave compensation is generous	80
Figure 2.23. Employee compensation under the Employment Commission's proposed "full-time equivalent" system, example of 24-month absence	82
Figure 2.24. Employer's sick leave compensation under the Employment Commission's proposals	85
Figure 2.25. In international tests of skills Norway's performance is mixed	93
Figure 2.26. Very high spending on education has not brought outstanding outcomes	94
Figure 2.27. High share of youth do not complete upper secondary education	94
Figure 2.28. There is almost universal enrolment of 3-year olds into early childhood education and care	95
Figure 2.29. Disadvantaged students have a relatively low probability of poor performance	95
Figure 2.30. The share of NEET youth is low	96
Figure 2.31. The participation of adults in education and training is high	96
Figure 2.32. The share of adults with low basic skills is low	97
Figure 2.33. Girls do better in all school subjects except physical education	98
Figure 2.34. Women have higher educational attainment than men	99
Figure 2.35. Labour market outcomes vary by field of study	101
Figure 2.36. Current skills imbalances in Norway	103
Figure 2.37. Net migration increased following the enlargement of the common European labour market	104
Figure 2.38. The composition of immigration has changed	105
Figure 2.39. The share of foreign-born people in Norway has risen	106
Figure 2.40. Employment rates of foreign born are significantly lower than that of natives	107
Figure 2.41. Educational attainment of immigrants differs considerably from that of natives	107
Figure 2.42. Share of workers in elementary occupations is very low in Norway	108
Figure 2.43. Unemployment rate of low educated immigrants is high	108

TABLES

Table 1. Mainland GDP growth will be around 2% in 2020 and 2021	10
Table 1.1. Macroeconomic indicators and projections (autumn 2019 Economic Outlook)	22
Table 1.2. Events that could lead to major changes in the outlook	26
Table 1.3. Past recommendations on macroeconomic and financial stability	29
Table 1.4. Past recommendations on fiscal policy, public spending and taxation	37
Table 1.5. Illustrative fiscal impact of recommended reforms	38
Table 1.6. Illustrative GDP impact of recommended reforms	38
Table 1.7. Past recommendations on improving business conditions	44
Table 1.8. Past recommendations on human capital, jobs and welfare	50
Table 1.9. Past recommendations on tackling environmental challenges	55
Table 2.1. Norway's sickness and disability system: key features and recent initiatives	79
Table 2.2. Norway's pension system, selected details	90