



With support from the European Union

Mutual assistance among European Labour Inspectors: a comparative study of the MS included in Project Cibeles

www.mtas.es/itss/index.html

Manuel Velázquez
Project Leader
Head of the Labour and Social Security
Inspectorate of Biscay

Convergence of Inspectorates Building a European Level Enforcement System (CIBELES)

*A PROJECT FOR SETTING UP EUROSH
(A European Network for Enforcement)*

THE PROJECT CIBELES

- The Project Cibeles has been approved by the Senior Labour Inspectors Committee (SLIC) in 2009.
- The kick-off meeting was in April 2010 and the Final Conference is taken place on 10th and 11th November 2011 in Madrid.
- **9 SLIC MEMBERS INVOLVED:**
 - The Labour Inspectorates from BELGIUM , MALTA, HUNGARY, FRANCE, AUSTRIA, GERMANY, ITALY, PORTUGAL AND SPAIN
- **MAIN ACTIVITIES**
 - Technical Visits to the countries involved –National Reports
 - A Conference of Experts in Mallorca (October 2010)
 - Meetings with experts of the European Commission in Brussels and Luxembourg
 - A survey about declarations of posting in Spain
 - A meeting of Cibeles Team Experts in Mallorca (June 2011) to elaborate conclusions and proposals

AIMS OF THE PROJECT CIBELES

- **Objective 1.**

HOW TO IMPROVE COOPERATION AND MUTUAL ASSISTANCE IN LABOUR INSPECTORS' ENFORCEMENT ACTIVITIES:

- **Objective 2.**

Making proposals to the SLIC and the Commission toward further initiatives, programmes and regulations about this issues

THE SIGNIFICANCE OF OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH (OSH)

- OSH IS THE COMMON COMPETENCE OF ALL THE EUROPEAN LABOUR INSPECTORATES
- CONSEQUENTLY, OUR ANALYSIS AND PROPOSALS ARE OSH - ORIENTED WITHOUT PREJUDICE OF THE GENERAL SCOPE OF SOME OF THEM
- OSH IS ALSO LINKED TO OTHER PROBLEMS

WHY IS IT NECESSARY COOPERATION AND MUTUAL ASSISTANCE?

- **EUROPEAN LABOUR INSPECTORS SHOULD ENFORCE OSH LEGAL RULES IN EQUIVALENT MANNER**
 - ☞ **All European MS share a common legislation on OSH** derived from the current Article 153 TFEU and the Directives approved
 - ☞ **European Labour Inspectors have to ensure their fulfilment and enforcement in an effective and uniform manner in order to guarantee comparable levels of protection in all the Member States** (Article 4.3 TEU and Article 4.2 of the Framework Directive 89/391/EEC and Community strategy 2007-2012 on health and safety at work).

- **EUROPEAN LABOUR INSPECTORS SHOULD CONTRIBUTE TO THE PROPER FUNCTIONING OF THE EUROPEAN INTERNAL MARKET**
 - ☞ With regard to the **FREE MOVEMENT OF GOODS** which can affect OSH, such as machinery or dangerous agents,
 - ☞ Also with regard to the **FREE PROVISION OF SERVICES** and particularly the **posting** of companies and workers: companies should guarantee the workers posted to another Member State the same terms and conditions of employment as regards labour conditions, including OSH conditions.
 - **Posting can involve a certain worsening of working conditions** where it combines with fewer resources available for workers, higher risks of fatigue because of frequent travels, no training provided in the host country, absence of mandatory protective equipment, sub-standard housing and dangerous transport.

MUTUAL ASSISTANCE IN ENFORCEMENT ACTIVITIES AT EUROPEAN LEVEL

- MUTUAL ASSISTANCE IS ALREADY FUNCTIONING IN OTHER SECTORS
 - ☞ All these matters have already been fully regulated at European level in other sectors as e.g. taxes or customs.
- IT IS NECESSARY TO ACHIEVE THE SAME LEVEL OF COOPERATION FOR LABOUR INSPECTORS
 - ☞ The aim of the Cibeles proposals would be to put mutual assistance between labour inspectorates at the same level as other similar institutions which carry out cross-border enforcement activities.



STEPS OF OUR ANALYSIS

FIRST STEP
Before the inspection

SECOND STEP
During the inspection

THIRD STEP
After the inspection

SOURCES OF INFORMATION FOR LABOUR INSPECTORS

MUTUAL ASSISTANCE IN THE INVESTIGATION OF BREACHES

CROSS-BORDER EXECUTION OF FINANCIAL PENALTIES

FIRST STEP

SOURCES OF INFORMATION FOR LABOUR INSPECTORS

SOURCES OF INFORMATION

- Available sources of information on companies, workers and workplaces are essential to design and plan any kind of inspection activities
- For cross-border enforcement activities on OSH it is necessary to have prior information on:

- **ALERTS ON OSH**

Alerts on OSH matters is a type of **spontaneous information** which can be analysed as a form of mutual assistance in the investigation of breaches from the point of view of the issuer and as a form of source of information from the point of view of the receptor.

We have preferred to include it in the second step

- **INFORMATION ON POSTED COMPANIES AND WORKERS**

They are not usually registered in the host country and for that reason Labour Inspectors need to obtain information about them

INFORMATION ABOUT POSTED COMPANIES AND WORKERS

| | BE | MT | HU | FR | AT | DE | IT | PT | ES |
|---|------------------------|------|------|----------------------------|----------------|------|------|------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Declaration of posting | App. Data base | App. | | App. Data Base in progress | App. Data Base | App. | | App. Data Base | App. |
| Registration of companies | | | | | | | | | X Construction Industry Data Base |
| Social Security A1 form | App. | App. | App. | App. | App. | App. | App. | App. | App. |
| Work –related Accidents of posted workers | App. Fatal and Serious | App. | App. | App. | App. | | App. | App. Fatal and Serious | App. Fatal and Serious |

THE DECLARATION OF POSTING

| DATA | | BE | MT | FR | AT | DE | PT | ES |
|-------------------|---------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| DEADLINE | | prior | prior | prior | prior | prior | prior | prior |
| COMPANY DATA | Name, address | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| | Representative | X | | X | X | X | | |
| | Activity | X | X | X | X | X | | |
| | Authorisation in the sending MS | | | | X | | | X |
| | Identity Number | X | | X | | | | X |
| WORKERS DATA | Name, address | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| | Nationality | X | X | X | X | | | |
| | Age | X | X | X | X | X | | |
| | Role | X | | X | | | | X |
| | Date of posting | X | | X | | | | |
| | Labour contract end date | X | | X | | | | |
| POSTING | Workplace | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| | Activity | X | X | X | X | X | | X |
| | Contractor | X | | X | X | X | X | X |
| | Duration | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| LABOUR CONDITIONS | Working hours | X | | | | | | |
| | Location of documents | X | | | | X | | |
| | Use of dangerous agents | | | X | | | | |
| | Salaries | | | X | | | | |
| | Collective Accommodation | | | X | | | | |

CONCLUSIONS ABOUT THE CURRENT INSTRUMENTS

- ABOUT THE DECLARATION AND REGISTRATION OF POSTED COMPANIES
 - ☞ Cibeles team experts agree about their utility to design and perform inspection tasks on working conditions on posted companies.
 - ☞ All the Cibeles MS, except Italy and Hungary, have mechanisms to control the arrival of posting companies but only three of them rely on a data base and therefore have reliable statistics and acceptable tools for monitoring them by Labour Inspectors.
 - ☞ Their content should be sufficient to allow supervision on labour conditions by the Inspectors. However, only in a few countries the requirement to inform on labour conditions (working hours, dangerous agents or collective accommodation) is provided.
- ABOUT A1 FORMS
 - ☞ The A1 Social Security forms would be a useful source of information for Labour Inspectors and an instrument to control de identity of posted workers.
 - ☞ The content of A 1 form is partially coincident with the declaration of posting
 - ☞ However, A1 forms are not usually available for Labour Inspectors in the most of countries.
- ABOUT COMMUNICATIONS ON WORK-RELATED ACCIDENTS
 - ☞ Actually the notification to a Social Security institution is usually made in order to obtain benefits whereas not always is submitted to Labour authorities of the host country. This entails underreporting and the difficulty to supervise OSH conditions in posted companies by Labour Inspectors

GENERAL CONCLUSIONS

- THE CURRENT INSTRUMENTS OF COMMUNICATION ON POSTING SHOULD BE IMPROVED
 - The information on posting contained in the declarations of posting, registration of posted companies and A1 forms is partially the same.
 - Bureaucratic burdens on businesses are doubled while at the same time the information received by regulatory authorities is fragmented and partial.
- LABOUR INSPECTORS NEED TOOLS TO IDENTIFY POSTED WORKERS IN WORPLACES
 - There is a problem of lack of tools to verify the real identity of posted workers

SECOND STEP

MUTUAL ASSISTANCE IN THE INVESTIGATION OF BREACHES

FACTORS WHICH DETERMINE THE NEED OF MUTUAL ASSISTANCE

- Mutual assistance demands a **SIMILAR COMPETENCE** between the requesting and requested public bodies
 - ☞ OSH IS THE ONLY COMMON COMPETENCE
- **SIMILAR INSPECTION POWERS** to be able to cooperate
 - ☞ ALL MS HAVE RATIFIED ILO CONVENTION 81
- The law of the requesting country should be applicable:
 - ☞ THE PRINCIPLE OF TERRITORIALITY:
The feasibility to enforce national legislation abroad
 - ☞ THE SCOPE OF NATIONAL LEGISLATIONS ON OSH:
The feasibility to apply national legislation in other MS

LABOUR INSPECTORATES' SCOPE OF COMPETENCES

| | BE | MT | HU | FR | AT | DE | IT | PT | ES | | |
|--------------|----------|----------------------------|----|----|---------|----------|-----|----|-------------|----|----|
| OSH | LI - OSH | OSHA - LI | LI | LI | LI | LI | Mut | LI | A S L | LI | LI |
| WORK TIME | SLI | DEP. EMPLOY M. | LI | LI | LI | LI | LI | LI | LI | LI | LI |
| WAGES | SLI | DEP. EMPLOY M. | LI | LI | Tax Adm | Tax Adm. | LI | LI | LI | LI | LI |
| ILLEGAL WORK | SLI | EMPLOY M. & TRAINING CORP. | LI | LI | Tax Adm | Tax Adm. | LI | LI | S S I | LI | LI |

INSPECTION POWERS ON OSH: ILO CONVENTION 81

| | BE | MT | HU | FR | AT | DE | IT | PT | ES |
|----------------------------------|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
| Visit workplaces | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| Summon | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| Requirements on private entities | - | - | - | - | - | X | | X | X |
| Improvement Notice | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| Stoppage | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| Infringement Procedure | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |

THE PRINCIPLE OF TERRITORIALITY

| | BE | MT | HU | FR | AT | DE | IT | PT | ES |
|--|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|-------------------|
| Breaches committed by posting companies on OSH can be prosecuted | x | x | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| Breaches on OSH committed by National companies abroad can be prosecuted | | | x | x | | | x | x | X Social Security |
| Cannot be prosecuted | | x | | | x | x | | | X Penal |

SCOPE OF NATIONAL LEGISLATIONS ON OSH

- THE APPLICATION OF CERTAIN OSH RULES OF THE SENDING COUNTRY TO CERTAIN ACTIVITIES PERFORMED IN THE HOST COUNTRY
 - ☞ Especially on services such as medical surveillance, occupational health and safety services and training whose effects go beyond the duration of posting.
- ONLY SOME COUNTRIES OF THE PROJECT CIBELES HAVE PROVIDED LEGISLATION ABOUT IT.
 - ☞ Italy has provided that the obligation on information and training on labour conditions correspond to posted companies
 - ☞ France have legislated establishing the recognition of the health services provided in the European country of origin when they can be considered equivalent.

CURRENT MUTUAL ASSISTANCE FORMS

Exchange of information

- **Request for information**
- **Spontaneous information:**
 - alerts on OSH: KSS
 - In case of infringement of the sending country legislation
- **Exchange of technical information on inspection matters:**
 - KSS: exchange of information without using personal data, in a voluntary basis

Cooperation

- **Hearing of witnesses:**
 - Investigation of breaches on work-related accidents:
- **Joint teams of investigation:**
 - Coordination on cross-border sites:
 - Control of companies which are acting simultaneously in several countries
 - Control of Transports
 - Cooperation on SLIC European campaigns
- **Support in administrative procedures**
 - Special Units or Networks
 - Notification

MUTUAL ASSISTANCE REGULATION: FACTORS WHICH DETERMINE IT

- PERSONAL DATA PROTECTION

PERSONAL DATA is any information relating to an identified or identifiable natural person” (Directive 95/46)

- One of a Labour Inspectorate core functions is to collect data on the basis of which conclusions are drawn and legal steps are enacted. Most of these data refer to persons and they may be individuals or legal entities.
- Collection, processing, preserving and communication of these data may affect an individual right of the respect for the privacy of personal and family life.
- The data collected and stored by Labour Inspectorates includes data on “identifiable natural persons” and this is considered in the majority of cases to constitute “**processing of personal data**”, even when the data is on paper and not in digital format.

- THE LEGAL VALUE OF EVIDENCES OBTAINED BY OTHER INSPECTORATES IN THE REQUESTING MS

LEGAL REQUIREMENTS ON PERSONAL DATA

- Following the opinions of the European Protection Data Supervisor (EDPS) on IMI:
 - “the protection of personal data is recognised as a fundamental right in Article 8 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the Union and in the case law on the basis of Article 8 of the European Convention on Human Rights (‘ECHR’)”
 - “Based on the case-law under the ECHR, **there should be no doubt about the legal status of provisions restricting fundamental rights.**
 - **Those provisions must be laid down in a legal instrument**, on the basis of the EC Treaty, which can be invoked before a judge.
 - **If not, the result would be legal uncertainty** for the data subject since he cannot rely on the fact that he can invoke the rules before a Court”.
- Another consequence would be the **uncertainty** of the regulatory authorities to use mutual assistance mechanisms for that reason
- Pursuant to the Directive 95/46/EC
 - ∞ Data must be processed for specified purposes
 - ∞ On the basis of the consent or the law
 - ∞ Everyone has the right of access and rectification
 - ∞ Compliance should be subjected to control

NATIONAL DATA PROTECTION REGULATIONS

| | BE | MT | HU | FR | AT | DE | IT | PT | ES |
|-----------------------------|---------------|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
| Directive Transposed | Draft pending | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| Protection of Legal persons | | | X | X | X | X | X | X | |

CURRENT REGULATIONS ON MUTUAL ASSISTANCE

- INTERNAL MARKET INFORMATION SYSTEM (IMI)
 - ☞ Regulated in Article 4 Directive 96/71. It started in 2011
 - ☞ The only form of mutual assistance regulated is the request for information: “replying to reasoned requests”
- CONVENTION FOR MUTUAL ASSISTANCE IN CRIMINAL MATTERS (2000)
 - ☞ It regulates all forms of mutual assistance
 - ☞ Mutual assistance shall also be afforded in proceedings brought by the **administrative authorities** in respect of acts which are punishable under the national law of the requesting or the requested Member State, or both, by virtue of being infringements of the rules of law, and **where the decision may give rise to proceedings before a court having jurisdiction in particular in criminal matters.**
 - ☞ There are different positions about the inclusion of administrative fines
 - Germany: Fines can be appealed to penal courts
 - Austria and Spain: fines can be appealed to courts for administrative affairs
 - Portugal, Belgium and Hungary: fines can be appealed to labour courts
 - PT and AT consider the Convention applicable, HU, ES and BE consider it not applicable
 - ☞ No real experience on Labour Inspectors matters
 - ☞ The Convention can not be used with regard to some countries: BE, HU, IT, ES

OTHER REGULATIONS ON MUTUAL ASSISTANCE

- **Bilateral Agreements**
 - ☞ Different legal nature:
 - Treaties approved by Parliaments legally binding
 - Sometimes they are non legally binding declarations: informal cooperation.
 - ☞ Their content varies considerably
- **Internal legislations can allow Mutual Assistance:**
 - ☞ Belgium : with regard to countries which have ratified ILO Convention 81
 - ☞ Spain: with regard to EU countries
- **European Convention on the Service Abroad of Documents relating to Administrative Matters. Strasbourg, 24.XI.1977 – Notification of administrative acts abroad**
 - No real experience and can not be used by LI in some countries

MUTUAL ASSISTANCE

| | BE | MT | HU | FR | AT | DE | IT | PT | ES |
|-------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------|---------------------|----------------|--------------------|---------------------------------------|
| IMI – PWD 96/71 | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| Convention 2000 in Criminal Matters | x Not for administrative sanctions | X No real exper. | X Not for administrative sanctions | X No real exper. | X No real exper | X No real Exper. | Not applicable | X No Real Exper | X Not for administrative sanctions |
| Bilateral Agreement | X | | X | x | x | x | X | x | X |
| Internal Law | X | | | | | | | | x |
| Convention 094 CE | X | | | X | X | X | X | X | X |



| | IMI | Convention 2000 | Bilateral Agreements | Internal Law | Convention 094 CE |
|------------------------------|-----|-----------------|----------------------|--------------|-------------------|
| Alerts on products | | | | | |
| Requests for information | X | X | X | X | |
| Hearing of Witness | | X | X | | |
| Presence in enquiries | | X | X | | |
| Joint teams | | X | X | | |
| Notification | | X | X | | X |
| Number of countries involved | All | 5/9 | 8/9 | 2/9 | 7/9 |

SUPPORT IN ENFORCEMENT PROCEDURES

- It is difficult that all Inspectors are up to date in legislation and practices in mutual assistance.
- They usually need the technical assistance of specialized officers.
- It is also difficult to set up steady mutual assistance relationships among regulatory authorities in enforcement matters to cope with complex issues which can affect several MS and companies.
- Transnational actions of enforcement on OSH usually need a proactive approach
- To form special units or network of experts can facilitate and promote these relationships

CONCLUSIONS ON MUTUAL ASSISTANCE IN THE INVESTIGATION OF BREACHES

- **ABOUT THE SCOPE OF LABOUR INSPECTORATES' COMPETENCE**
 - ☞ The only common competences for European Labour Inspectorates is Occupational Health and Safety (OSH)
 - ☞ Legal framework should be flexible and allow Mutual Assistance whatever is feasible
- **ABOUT THE LABOUR INSPECTOR'S POWERS**
 - ☞ Mutual assistance is usually carried out between Labour Inspectors with common investigation powers and within proceedings of administrative nature to investigate breaches.
- **ABOUT THE PRINCIPLE OF TERRITORIALITY**
 - ☞ Mutual assistance could be requested by the host country with regard to posting companies and workers but also by the country of origin authorities if their law is also applicable to national posting companies when they are abroad
 - ☞ With regard to OSH services, such as medical surveillance and training, it is not sufficiently clear the applicable legislation in posting
- **ABOUT MUTUAL ASSISTANCE REGULATIONS**
 - ☞ It is necessary a prior legal regulation to allow the transmission of information due to the right to protection of personal data
 - ☞ Request for information is the only form of mutual assistance currently regulated in all MS. Other forms do not affect all MS or they are not legally binding
 - ☞ The legal evidence value for exchanged information is not regulated at European level

THIRD STEP

FINES AND EXECUTION OF FINES TO POSTING COMPANIES

PUNISHMENT PROCEDURES OF LABOUR INSPECTORATES

| | BE | MT | HU | FR | AT | DE | IT | PT | ES |
|-------------------------|--|-------------------------------------|--|---------------------|--|---|---|---|--|
| Penal Sanction | X (30%) | x | | x | | | X | | |
| Administrative Sanction | X (70%) They can be appealed to Labour Courts | X Can be appealed to Civil Court | X They can be appealed to Labour Courts | X in a few cases | X They can be appealed to Courts for Adm. Affairs | X They can be appealed to Penal Courts | X They can be appealed to Adm. Affairs | X They can be appealed to Labour Court | X They can be appealed to Courts for Adm. Affairs |

LEGAL ROLE OF LABOUR INSPECTORS IN PUNISHMENT PROCEEDINGS

| | BE | MT | HU | FR | AT | DE | IT | PT | ES |
|---|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
| Prosecutors of criminal offences | X | X | | X | | | X | | |
| Prosecutors of administrative infringements | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |

THE LIABILITY ON OSH

| | BE | MT | HU | FR | AT | DE | IT | PT | ES |
|--|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|------|
| Employer liability | App | App | App | App | App | App | App | App | App |
| Subsidiary liability of main contractor | | | App | | | | App | | |
| Direct responsibility of the main contractor | | | | | | App | App | | App. |
| Joint liability of the main contractor | | | | | | | | App | App |

FWD 2005/214/JHA application of the principle of mutual recognition to financial penalties

- Execution of fines promoted by Labour Inspectorates (especially on OSH) can be clearly carried out by FWD 2005/214 rules when the fines are imposed by judicial authorities and when they are imposed by administrative authorities and can be appealed before penal courts as it occurs in France, Malta, Germany, Belgium (in 30% of cases) and Italy (when these two MS implement the FWD).
- It is more **dubious** when the fines are imposed by administrative authorities and they can be appealed before other courts than penal courts, in particular for administrative or labour affairs as Austria, Hungary, Portugal, Belgium (70% of cases) and Spain.
 - ☞ Austria and Portugal consider FWD applicable to their administrative fines
 - ☞ Hungary, Belgium and Spain consider FWD no applicable
- This aspect concerns not only the countries which deliver administrative fines but also the countries which should execute them. France does not accept fines which can not be appealed to Penal or Criminal Courts

Application of the FWD to fines which can be appealed to courts other than penal or criminal courts

| BE | MT | HU | FR | AT | DE | IT | PT | ES |
|----------------|-----|--------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-----|----------------|---------------------|--------------------|
| Not transposed | App | App | App | App | App | Not transposed | App | App |
| | | Not for adm. Fines | Not for adm. Fines | Also for Adm. Fines | | | Also for Adm. Fines | Not for adm. fines |

SCOPE OF THE FWD 2005/214/JHA

- Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) and other matters relating to Posting Workers Directive 96/71/EC **are not expressly mentioned in the list of matters** of this Decision pursuant to article 5 (1)
- However, the last paragraph states that “offences established by the issuing State and serving the purpose of implementing obligations arising from instruments adopted **under the EC Treaty** or under Title VI of the EU Treaty”.
- Pursuant to the paragraph 3 of this article, offences other than those covered by paragraph 1 are subjected to **the condition of double criminality** in both Member States.
- Some participants of the Cibeles Project consider very **doubtful** that the FWD 2005/214 could be applicable to the infringements in matters relating to Article 3 of the Posting Workers Directive 96/71 which include OSH infringements according to the context of the FWD 2005/214 (the former third pillar or the current Title V of the TFEU –area of freedom, safety and justice-). It has to be verified if only criminal offences are in focus

Directive 2010/24/EC concerning mutual assistance for the recovery of claims relating to taxes, duties and other measures

- **Directive 2010/24/EC**, which will be in force at January 1st 2012,
- Article 2.2. provides the execution of administrative penalties (Article 2.2.) imposed by the administrative authorities that are competent to levy the taxes **or duties concerned or carry out administrative enquiries with regard to them, or confirmed by administrative or judicial bodies at the request of those administrative authority.**
- These penalties can be based **on public duties of any kind** levied by or on behalf of a Member State or its territorial or administrative subdivisions, including the local authorities, or on behalf of the Union (Article 2.1).
- However, the scope of this Directive could be dubious since the term “duty” could only be referred to **pecuniary obligations relating to public incomes** without involving penalties relating to other non pecuniary public duties such as those on occupational health and safety.

CONCLUSIONS ON EXECUTION OF FINES

- **FURTHER ANALYSIS**

- It will be necessary **to analyse in the near future the real application** of the FWD 2005/214 and Directive 2010/24 in order to obtain definitive conclusions on this matter.

- **THE NEED OF A NEW REGULATION**

- The current regulations on cross-border execution of fines are not applicable in several countries and only a new regulation could solve this problem

- **INFRINGEMENTS AND LIABILITY:**

- Infringements and liabilities on OSH varies considerably in Member States. This could jeopardize the mutual assistance and mutual recognition of fines

THE END

Muchas gracias por vuestra atención

THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR
YOUR ATTENTION